Appendix B – Next Steps

'Next Steps comment cards asked about which socioeconomic criteria (types of effects) we should consider when selecting possible reintroduction sites for further study. Below are the specific questions asked.

- 1) What specific criteria do you want to be sure we consider in this area?
- 2) What are the best measures for the criteria you identified?
- 3) How might we manage socioeconomic impacts in a fair and equitable way?

Results were sorted by community where the comment was received. We did our best to transcribe every comment card. We used the text "[...]" to indicate either illegible penmanship and/or to remove of personal identifiable information.

Table 1 Next steps comments received in Astoria, OR on June 20,2023.

What specific criteria do you want to be sure we consider in this area?	What are the best measures for the criteria you identified?	How might we manage socioeconomic impacts in a fair and equitable way?
I am concerned about the negative impacts to the	Dollars gained or lost is the most important to	Compensating fishermen not to fish doesn't help
Dungeness crab fishery and oyster growers. There	me. Our small coastal communities don't have	the various support businesses. Once otters are
are many support businesses that rely on these	many other options to attract industry based off	introduced there will be no way to keep the
industries to thrive.	our remote locations. Therefore, we can't risk any	population in-check. Society won't allow it. Sea
	damage to the industries we have.	lions on the Columbia River are a great example.
		They have been a contributor to the demise of
		our salmon stocks, and sturgeon populations but
		there is no socially accepted method to control
		sea lion population. There is strong evidence of
		crab fisheries in Alaska that were once viable for
		commercial and recreational harvest that no
		longer exists due to decimation by otters.
Impacts on fisheries & fishing communities;	\$\$; Cultural value of losses to fisheries;	Community - based efforts (grassroots); Impacts,
Impacts on recreational fisheries; Impacts on	Importance/value of Dungeness crab fishery	value, needs will vary by community
aquaculture operations; Impacts on port		
maintenance & operations; Ecotourism related to		
Dungeness crab fishery		
look deep into all southeast Alaska shellfish	several non-biased scientific studies covering	I feel this would devastate near-shore shellfish
fisheries and the impact sea otters have had on	impact on shellfish fisheries	fisheries, the same that has happened in coastal
those fisheries		Alaska communities - Homer, Cordova,
		Petersburg, Sitka, Ketchikan not to mention
		sport fisheries, Razor clam, as well as other clam
		fisheries/species. Sport crabbing the list goes on

What specific criteria do you want to be sure we consider in this area?	What are the best measures for the criteria you identified?	How might we manage socioeconomic impacts in a fair and equitable way?
Restoring tribal hunting grounds; Tourism - eco tours for cruise ship tourists & locals; Becoming a center of learning, academic research and associated employment opportunities	Jobs related to restoration, tourism dollars based on ecotourism, academic opportunities to support research (Career Pathway certificate @ Clatsop Community College, agreements w/ Chinook and tribal entities that reflect tribal needs/ cultural consideration	If reintroduction is documented to significantly decrease Dungeness & oyster fisheries - I'd want evidence rather than conjecture that this is occurring before measures at compensation are taken. The oyster fishery is already in decline, for example due to the other invertebrate considerations. I'd look for proof sea otters are directly implicated to additional declines. My thinking is that "forage - f[.]" could be leveraged in the meantime. Tourists are often interested in seaweed, mussel, crab foraging - The fishing community may be encouraged to seek their fortune in the tourism trade, already alive & well here in Astoria.

Table 2 Next steps comments received at Garibaldi, OR on June 21, 2023.

What specific criteria do you want to be sure we consider in this area?	What are the best measures for the criteria you identified?	How might we manage socioeconomic impacts in a fair and equitable way?
What matters to us, maybe not to the economy is	?	Like most things we want to make fair, listening
making the effort for the environment & then		to everybody who has something to say about
seeing how the values emerge		their values is a start. The complaints are always
		"we want them to listen to us". It's still not easy,
Biological diversity and environmental balance.	Tourism potential, possibly greater diversity in	Subsidize necessary equipment upgrades for
I'm distressed by the poverty of our tide pools	the commercial products available, e.g. seaweed	shellfish farms in those reintroduction areas
and beaches compared to my childhood. Choose	and other marine products, carbon sequestration,	
best likelihood of success in genetic expansion in	temperature moderation.	
sea otter population		
The effect on the fishing community. Tillamook	Diving employment. Pounds of clams/oysters	I have no ideas other than the measurable affects
Bay has been a rich source of many clams and	harvested out of Tillamook Bay. The amount of	mentioned on the other side. Maybe trackable
oysters and even over a few years the effects of	clams/oysters already available in the bay vs what	collars on sea otters to keep count and remove
reintroduction of sea otters may affect the	a single sea otter can consume daily.	when additional sea otters show up. A balance
sustainability of a very sustainable fishery.		needs to be achieved between the care of people
		and animals.
What matters to us commercial fisherman/clam	I think that it will greatly effect many different	All in all I just don't believe a reintroduction is
divers is the sustainability of the clams that grow	jobs that are based off clams/oysters in this bay. I	necessary. We have river otters already and the
here in Tillamook Bay, about 90% of the	don't believe sea otter proofing will work it will	reintroduction seems like it will be worse for our
commercially harvest clams for bait/food come	be more bad to the ecosystem by destroying	ecosystem. I think there is more at stake than just
from this bay in Oregon and I believe	other species that also live in this bay.	the clams/oysters. There is no benefits of trying
reintroduction of the otters will greatly affect		to reintroduction I do however know that there
many different areas in a bad way.		would have to be some kind of regulation on
		otters, if we can't hunt them how are you
		planning on regulating the population so it doesn't get out of control?

What specific criteria do you want to be sure we consider in this area?	What are the best measures for the criteria you identified?	How might we manage socioeconomic impacts in a fair and equitable way?
The clams. 90% of clams commercially harvested in the State of Oregon come from Tillamook Bay. Introducing sea otters to the Bay would be disastrous to our clam population.	The loss of an industryIf the otters decimate the clam population, there will no longer be a dive fishery in the State of Oregon	At this moment I cannot think of any ideas to offset any of the negative effects. Because the negative effects would be to great. I would have to strongly suggest NOT reintroducing sea otters to Tillamook Bay. I am a member of the []. Our main objective is to preserve the sustainability of clams in the Bay. Reintroducing otters to the bay would go against all that we've been working towards.
Working with the industries effected to create understanding and relationship that allow positive reactions moving forward. How can we work together?	Already a failing concept unless your looking to use this as a false profit gain. (circled "measured in dollars gained or lost" on card); Where do the otters benefit the most/where does the environment also gain equal benefits without negative effect over 100 year cycle???	Otter sanctuary in an environment that allows the otters to be introduced in ways that have positive effects for both the otters & the environment. Using government land to create a rehabilitation center that is a natural environment allowing the most natural reintroductions. I believe that saving smaller amounts getting higher success rates VS potentially killing more otters than saving. Create jobs and revenue threw allowing education and awareness VS a disconnect and lack of education. Native American tribes fish & leave their gear in the waters creating more possible dangers for the otters. They will be willing to say they are helping but more regulations need to be implied.
existence value, ecosystem services, kelp forest reforestation, carbon sequestration	biodiversity / carbon sequestration	

Table 3 Next steps comments received at Newport, OR on June 21, 2023.

What specific criteria do you want to be sure we consider in this area?	What are the best measures for the criteria you identified?	How might we manage socioeconomic impacts in a fair and equitable way?
How does this link with marine reserves to lead to a healthy ocean ecosystem? A good measure could be kelp forest restoration. (# of acres). How would otters be affected by off-shore wind power generation or current generation?	Reintroduction of sea otters could reduce urchin extirpation of kelp forests. Restoration of kelp forest buffers to the shoreline likely would lead to measurable, beneficial impacts to the shore line reduction of erosion, species diversity	Consultation w/ stakeholders (i.e. Tribe, fisheries) and inclusion in on-going, dynamic management strategies. Pro-actively support impacted (or projected-to-be-impacted) oyster farmers with monitoring systems and data collection to mitigate predation. Support the presentation of the status of the project by communicating with the local community via local venues i.e. Hatfield Marine Science/ OR Coast Aquarium, schools.
I think bringing the otter back will have myriad positive effects on not only the ecosystem, but also economic there might be some economic loses, but [] and we need to do out best to mitigate them.	I don't feel qualified to answer- evaluation is complicated but what matters to most people is their own quality of life- so how can we make this personal, meaningful? Break up the audiences, ask the different sectors (rec, fisheries, tourism, tribal) and [] in bringing these groups together, telling the whole story, but making it personal.	Definitely we need to figure out how to reimburse fisheries for taking measures to protect otters, reward them for maintaining them - make it visible to the public. Perhaps a tax on the rec tourism/ to help pay for this? Tribes and BIPOC communities need to be place in the center of this discussion-and should lead this discussion to ensure that harms to their ability to fish, etc. are going to be mitigated if at all possible.
Otters belong here ; Also, in terms of tourism, it is important to educate the public on appropriate wildlife viewing & photography	# of sea otters; I understand that people are developing methods to measure global & ocean carbon budgets. (Blue carbon)	I think that it is important to consider the benefits in terms of climate. Sea otters were keystone species and are beneficial for healthy kelp forests. Kelp forests have many benefits including to healthy ocean ecosystems and carbon sequestration as well. And consider the benefits in terms of carbon balance.

What specific criteria do you want to be sure we consider in this area?	What are the best measures for the criteria you identified?	How might we manage socioeconomic impacts in a fair and equitable way?
This area does not have a large bi-valve industry that would be effected. The crab fisherman would needlessly worry but it would be mostly inshore crabbers (recreational) that would be effected! Increased biodiversity would be a fair trade!	Important to me is seeing sea otters thrive and the ecosystem as a whole. Economic effects will be difficult to quantify since there are so many variables. Tourism will increase! Maybe the cities can give back to economically effected (negatively) industries/ businesses.	Value will come to all of us through increased biodiversity and advantageous ecological impacts. There will be winners for sure like tour operators but I don't think there will be many losers in Newport & local areas. An increased hotel tax & other services tax could be dispersed to local negatively impacted businesses- but that would not seem sustainable.
The largest consideration is overall benefit to the ecosystem. Second is intrinsic valve. Knowing they are part of our environment is worth a lot	The largest benefits are those that can't be measured in dollars	
In the locations they are introduced I would hope there's wildlife officers protecting them from the extreme opposition. A large number of tourists could become a problem also.		Trying to please everyone never works. You guys are the scientists and I wish you could make the move regardless. Keep up the hard work. It helps us all. Mother knows best.
Nearby rehabilitation center, team of scientists to monitor otters	Money to support scientists and infrastructure	Compensate fisheries (urchin, clam, crab) as needed. Have the urchin fisheries get paid to assist w/monitoring sea otters @ the rate they might lose income from otters in their area.
Tribal subsistence and involvement of the tribes in possible reintroduction site selection	sites being considered	Raise awareness/develop of possible ways to integrate impacted sectors with these benefitting from reintroduction
fishing regulations	scientist at NOAA	
A rehabilitation center for sick or injured or abandoned otters. Great for wildlife viewing/tourism. Not great for shellfish fisheries	Build a rehabilitation center @ OCA! Compare finances between several years of tourism & fishing industry	Help fisherman afford otter proof gear by taxing the tourism industry? Help fisherman switch to fin fish rather than shellfish.
Measures taken to give otters a safe space to allow protection from possible destruction of habitats by the public. Where might those exist? And what locations they may be. Would this impact tourism, would there be "view points"?	Visitor counts of parks/beaches near otter habitats.; Quality locations to easily isolate the otters from the public.; Survey from public on locations easily seen after re-introduction	An otter support take could be implemented to gather funds from those positively impacted to provide assistance in re-design of operations and equipment to those that would suffer a negative Impact

What specific criteria do you want to be sure we consider in this area?	What are the best measures for the criteria you identified?	How might we manage socioeconomic impacts in a fair and equitable way?
Tourism opportunities to view sea otters. Making sure to consider the effects of small sustainable fishing operations (I know y'all will)	Tourism - dollars (helping \$ local, new job opportunities, expansion to existing tourism); Fishing - dollars (gain or loss within X number of years)	Fishing charters marketing sea otter tours like most to with whale watching.
Are there plans for sea otter rehabilitation for injured or abandoned otters. How would potential rehabilitation be funded.		
1) environmental benefits to fishing restoration (Orford Reef, et al.) and ecosystem balance. 2) economic benefits to local tourism (not just kayaks) 3) Tribal subsistence where historic tribal use of sea otter pelts can be established (not sure about Siletz tribal consortium) 4) educational benefits to residents of Oregon (statewide)	Destination surveys (tourism): teacher survey (along w/link to applicable resource) Fishing survey, fish surveys (along w/catch), kelp surveys, urchin sampling surveys, tribal input	Believe that before any public discussion of time, there really should be a clear nonbiased press release on what is happening to Oregon kelp beds and why distributed statewide. Many fishery proponents who are currently against reintroduction would be surprised to learn that they may not have their fishery if the kelp beds continue to deteriorate. Some even believe that pycnopodia has already made a comeback, which is highly exaggerated. Rumors like that make it hard to present a reintroduction plan, because commercial & recreational fisheries don't see the risk/need. They believe that otters are "our mongoose" which is so misinformed. For the oyster farmers-possibly research on ways to protect "oyster popsicles" from otter predation?

What specific criteria do you want to be sure we consider in this area?	What are the best measures for the criteria you identified?	How might we manage socioeconomic impacts in a fair and equitable way?
Long term ecological benefits to Oregon's nearshore environment.	Ecological benefits can be translated to economic terms through non-monetary benefits such as existence value or to monetary benefits such as increase in habitable fish populations due to ecosystem improvements. Additional economic benefits include increase in ecotourism.	Depending on location of the otter population, there will likely be impacts to shellfish fisheries. Some impacts will be relatively minor and the fisheries should be able to absorb the impacts. Where impacts are larger and can be thoroughly documented, I think direct compensation to the impacted fishermen would be warranted and would probably be less expensive than setting up some sort of complex system to somehow transfer gains of beneficiaries to offset losses to those impacted.
Increase in tourism in many forms - increased impacts of more people to sensitive ecological areas - educational value of understanding predation/ecosystems	change in attitudes & understanding; monitoring specific sites - vegetation/animal diversity; intent to travel	
I will be backpacking on the Olympic coast near lake Ozette, and my companions and I chose this area b/c we thought we might see sea otters. On our trip, we will buy gas, go to restaurants, and pay camping fees: all benefits to the local economy	Gains in dollars from gas stations, gains in dollars for restaurants, difference in visitation for local parks, campsites, and wilderness areas.	

What specific criteria do you want to be sure we		How might we manage socioeconomic impacts
consider in this area?	identified?	in a fair and equitable way?
I'm concerned about how otter reintroduction		I want to see the MMPA law changed to allow
could impact fishing dependent communities in		Oregon's Indigenous peoples be allowed to
southern Oregon, particularly Charleston, Port		harvest otter if they are reintroduced/re-
Orford, & Brookings. I'm concerned w/ how		established in OR. I'm also curious what
reintroduced otters could impact declining &		mechanisms are available to mitigate otter effects
vulnerable abalone populations. I'm worried		on shellfish fishers. And when estimating
about how tribal subsistence harvesting for		potential economic impacts, I think its important
shellfish could be impacted. I also think some of		to use updated fishery value #s (e.g. todays price
your messaging around the potential benefits to		per pound of urchins), as well as to factor in the
kelp forests. For instance, I think you need to		fact that tourism jobs are not as high paying as
make it clear that otters can't fix urchin barrens		many fishing jobs. Also, again ABALONE! I would
on short time scales, and you're messaging		be devastated if we lost OR's abalone to
around kelp & carbon sequestration is misleading.		reintroduced otters.
Non-native American values we have (we are	Just stop human interference, stop sea food	When logging was reduced in the 90's we re-
European based folks) who also revere the	production, reintroduce otters and wait for things	trained loggers to learn other jobs- Ron Wyden
balance otters would bring back that is not	to balance out	helped secure the funding. Do this again so fishers
recreational, spiritual/ religious or cultural. Its just		will stop and let the oceans repopulate &
important.		normalize.

What specific criteria do you want to be sure we consider in this area?	What are the best measures for the criteria you identified?	How might we manage socioeconomic impacts in a fair and equitable way?
Fisheries - we can't control what species or how	You can't put a price on having existing abalone	I don't know if we can. Oregon has a few very
much of each species otters will eat. Urchin	populations in Oregon. They are literally priceless.	sustainable & well managed shellfish fisheries
divers, clam divers, crabbers will be most greatly	I'm comfortable measuring economic benefits of	that sea otters could threaten. Each fishing
affected. Management of these fisheries will be	other fisheries & species that are well managed,	operation is a small business that supports
incredibly complicated with sea otters in the	but abalone are extremely vulnerable in Oregon.	Oregon families. A few of the fisheries that could
picture. Could be good for some fisheries, terrible		be impacted by otters. 1. Red sea urchin - This
for others		fishery is well managed & has taken off in recent
		years. Sea otters could drive urchin divers out of
		business. 2. Dungeness crab -Largest single
		species fishery in Oregon. I'm concerned how
		many sub-legal & legal sized crab otters would eat. If they eat the sub-legals that would
		drastically complicate management. 3. Abalone -
		not a fishery but a very important ESA listed
		species in OR. Otters would decimate our
Tribes have been decimated; culturally,	? Some countries use the Precautionary Principle.	
economically for over 150 years. Respect,	It will benefit the most people in the long run.	
preserve the tribes. Can costs to local oyster		
farms be mitigated by re-training into outdoor		
recreation which employs>120,00 workers		
annually? Marine reserves have proven beneficial.		
Restoring the balance to nature (by re-introducing		
otters) is paramount		
1) effects on Tribal cultural values & harvest	1) Tribal access & culturally important species 2)	Discounts/subsidies/grants for fishers to upgrade
2) benefit of having a fully - functioning ecosystem	Biodiversity of intertidal/nearshore ecosystems	gear to be sea otter safe. Programs to support
(w/sea otters present as the predator) for climate		development of tourism businesses related to sea
change resilience/climate refugia		otters
Tribal connection and resource use, recreational	for social impacts, measure [] community	Focuse [] to understand communities & not
opportunities effects on climate change	feedback, recreation through [], climate change	necessarily focus on [] monetary gain or loss.
mitigation, effects on commercial fisheries	though [] use. Commercial fisheries through	Bigger focus on ecosystem and ecological change
	stock assessments.	

What specific criteria do you want to be sure we consider in this area?	What are the best measures for the criteria you identified?	How might we manage socioeconomic impacts in a fair and equitable way?
		·
I work in the tourist industry []. We have a \$171	We can measure the economic effect as tourism	The benefits of sea otter reintroduction far
million economic impact on this area. Sea otters	increases. There is a growing demand for eco-	outweigh the losses - boosts for tourism and
would boost tourism and as a keystone species,	tourism. We can measure the impact on fisheries	fisheries, restored kelp forests which sequester
protect critical habitat, enhancing local fish	through bio surveys and an increase in healthy	carbon, sea urchin populations kept in check,
populations.	kelp forests as sea otters consume sea urchins.	healthy habitats for other species and cultural
		value for indigenous people. The only negative
		impact could be on the shellfish industry, but we
		can mitigate that through monetary incentives or
		by adapting the industry to coexist with sea
		expanded tourism possibilities; school sea otter
		sightseeing/education programs, part of outdoor
		school or aquatic camps for kids that may form a
		class connection to mammals

Table 4 Next steps comment cards from Florence, OR on June 22, 2023.

What specific criteria do you want to be sure we consider in this area?	What are the best measures for the criteria you identified?	How might we manage socioeconomic impacts in a fair and equitable way?
Long term habitat restoration for all sea life		There are concerns that reintroduction will affect
		commercial fishing. Investigation of potential long
		term benefits & due to improved health of the
		habitat & publication of the results might help.
		economic impacts are immediate, ecological
		effects are forever. If we don't have healthy
		coast, you lose the economic benefits. Humans
		responsible for loss of sea otters on coast; also
		our responsibility to see coast is restored.
		Understand concerns of crabbers, but in long run
		definitely worth it for sake of coastal ecosystem
Ecotourism in balance with sustainable jobs e.g.	The benefit to learning for Oregon residents. Kids,	
shellfish harvest. We enjoy crab & other food	college students, citizens of coastal residents.	
sources & this area of work is important for	Best way to measure effects: Conservation stamp	
coastal communities. As an educator though I	nomination of sea otters. Have people able to	
want to know that reintroductions are fair to	buy these prints at watchable wildlife locations	
local communities but also safe for the otters. i.e.	e.g. Cape Perpetua, Depoe Bay.	
a win-win for all.		
Tribal subsistence is the most important to me!	Just the benefits to the kelp is #1 Bring back	
Oyster farms are for profit and can adapt & co	otters as soon as possible. Thanks.	
exist with sea otters The urchin population is out		
of control!		

Table 5 Next steps comments received at Coos Bay, OR on June 22, 2023.

What specific criteria do you want to be sure we consider in this area?	What are the best measures for the criteria you identified?	How might we manage socioeconomic impacts in a fair and equitable way?
We need the otters		
		Potential sea otter habitat: Cape Arago Lighthouse south to 5 mile (Glasshouse); Blacklock PT to Cape Blanco; North & South of Portord Harbor going north to Agate beach south to about Humburg Mtn.; Humburg mountain to Sisters Rocks; possibly Rouge Reef; Cape Sebastian to Brookings; Crescent City - St George Reef; C.C. south end of Enderts Beach go south & past mouth of Klamath river. []
Restoring kelp forests and all the benefits they provide (too many to list here). Economic benefits to fishing & tourism (the kind who cherish nature & life). Knowing a long-removed species is home again. Tribal benefits & peace of mind & subsistence. Just being able to watch them or even just know they are back. Reduce coastal erosion.	Economic - fishing & tourism fairly easy as you say. Culture benefit & joy in their return-ask people as you are doing now. Telescopes (stationary), track use (Battle Rock). Tribal benefit - ask them. Level of public interest - surveys, online, etc. Public events that grow up around them, e.g., Otter days, annual. Please bring them back-they are missed.	

What specific criteria do you want to be sure we	What are the best measures for the criteria you	How might we manage socioeconomic impacts
consider in this area?	identified?	in a fair and equitable way?
how the economic benefits to recreational	The establishment of new businesses within the	I can see this as a big positive to tourism and
tourism will change. I enjoy the ocean & the	recreation/tourism sector. Along those lines is	possibly using the successes from these
introduction of sea otters could result in more	the number of visitors within the area, including	businesses to support continued livelihood
resources in the sector. Another is the affect on	those trying new activities or establishing groups	success for shellfish industry workers. This would
aquaculture, thinking of this possibly being more	within the community.	take time and could be adapted possibly. As
of an important market & revenue source in the		ecosystem services increase, funds from
future for food security in a changing climate.		benefited businesses can go towards those
More costs/declines can cause less desire to get		aquaculture sector, helping with equipment and
into this market or continue.		permits. Since the impacts are expected to be a
		slow onset, the assistance to permitting could
		help too if that ends up being a big barrier. If
		anything, supporting capacity to assist
		aquaculture & fisheries technically could help
		increase the sense of impatience for them with
		government agencies Fisheries that have benefits
		can also be used to fund other fishing
		communities. I see any event or big production
		involving sea otters can establish a fund they
		contribute to and those that need it can apply
		and be a part of those people that can be eligible
Absolutely tribal subsistence/cultural values.	We would see repopulations of sunstar? sea stars	
Equally important kelp forest preservation and	and abalone. Otters would be not very visible but	
rebuilding for overall health of our oceanic	important for visitors/tourism like in Monterey	
ecosystems.	Bay/Big Sur area.	
health of ecosystem as climate change impacts		
animal, sea, & bird life.; the economic viability of		
those dependent on healthy fisheries & shellfish,		
etc. is important to consider & to educate		
community members on these interactions; in		
the past, educating citizens has been important		

What specific criteria do you want to be sure we	What are the best measures for the criteria you	How might we manage socioeconomic impacts
consider in this area?	identified?	in a fair and equitable way?
The Coos Bay estuary is an important recreational	Don't pick Coos Bay as a good area to put these	By not putting them in estuaries as a starting
fishing area. Sea otters would be a detriment to	animals. There are many better areas to start the	point.
many aspects of the employment picture in the	reestablishment.	
region.		
As I am rather biased in favor of sea otters	I feel that sea otters are adaptable and can be	
repopulating the coast currently void of sea	troublesome during relocation. Perhaps a	
otters, I have little to offer concerning	program can be utilized where "surplus" animals	
socioeconomic values. I wish for USFWS be	can be temporally held in facilities simulating	
successful in restoring the historical range as	natural conditions. The example of the Elkhorn	
much as practical.	releases is another method that can be replicated	
	on the Oregon coast (i.e. Newport's Oregon Coast	
	Aquarium). The past efforts were noble, but	
	ended up unsuccessful. I think this process,	
	gathering many diverse folks ideas and input can	
	lead to a success. An effort that would work is to	
	translocate greater number of otters than in the	
	past and certainly give them the opportunity to	
	frequent locations the otters themselves prefer. I	
	am sure there's the risk of individual otters	
	perishing as well. Since it's a hard job to be an	
	otter in the wild, there's always the risk of	
	individual otters perishing in their original home	
	range as well. Be as flexible in this process as the	
	sea otter can be flexible. I only wish that this plan	
	works. P.S. Many States natural resource	
	departments successfully relocated river otters,	
	which enhanced sport fisheries. The same will	
	happen when sea otter presence will improve	
	kelp beds (and now I know, eelgrass) and thus	
	improve healthy grounds for sport and	
	commercial fisheries, crabbing.	

Table 6 Next steps comments received at Port Orford, OR on June 23, 2023.

What specific criteria do you want to be sure we consider in this area?	What are the best measures for the criteria you identified?	How might we manage socioeconomic impacts in a fair and equitable way?
Potential positive impacts on tourism and kayaking, sight-seeing, etc. The negative impacts on sea urchin fishing, other shellfish fishing, and aquaculture farming.	Tourism (arrow) surveys counting how many people were here to see sea otters, and # of people renting kayaks/ AirB&Bs over time. The \$ lost from shellfish fisheries.	The abalone, urchin, clam, and other shellfish fisheries are going to be negatively impacted. Additionally, abalone and sunflower sea stars are already on the declines with abalone going up into the nearshore because they are struggling so badly. This will make them even more sensitive to otter predation. I'm not sure how these negative impacts would be counteracted, but maybe there could be some kind of economic compensation to urchin, clam, and other shellfish fishers. In small coastal communities like Port Orford, the economy relies heavily on fishing, so there would
Nearshore fisheries impacts		need to be some kind of support to counter act the fisheries decline.
Mortality of sea otters in the reintroduction	Observe and measure see atter nanulations Long	Conduct a study of similar sites are and past
·	Observe and measure sea otter populations. Long	Conduct a study of similar sites pre and post
areas; Tourism to the many small communities	term city income data analysis; for the Monterey	introduction of sea otters. See how they were
that do really need it to support local	Bay, over 99% of the local GDP originates from	managed and how communities were affected
communities	tourism and less than 1% comes from fishing	and use these to inform how best to manage. Of
		course, also conducting surveys of local
		stakeholders and forming a council with a
		deadline to come up with solutions to manage
		these socioeconomic impacts. Balance rights of
		indigenous and locals, inform more of benefits,
		come up with balanced decisions
Changes to food web; changes to ecosystem	Prey choices: zombie urchins vs other prey;	Collaborating with different stakeholders to
structure; Tribal collaboration/communication;	likelihood of consuming different prey; impact on	compromise - potential incentives or other
impact on fisheries	ecosystem at large, specific species (fisheries)	solutions to make up potential losses? Clearly
		communicating and acknowledging benefits and especially negative effects - listening

What specific criteria do you want to be sure we	What are the best measures for the criteria you	How might we manage socioeconomic impacts
consider in this area?	identified?	in a fair and equitable way?
Atonement (extinction), traditional values, bring	Collect info from tribes, tourists, fisher folk,	Definitely use some of the economic gains to help
back kelp forest here, enhance fishing and	residents (landowners and not), businesses,	those who are negatively impacted. Tourist "otter
tourism (those who value Nature), protect coasts	people's joy in seeing (or even just knowing) the	fee" or donations. Install land-based telescopes
(erosion- kelp beds), sequester carbon, otters are	otters are here again, health of kelp forest,	and automatically monitor use (how long,
beautiful and historic and many more (as you are	fishers' catches and profit, (or loss), air quality (?),	direction, etc.) Public education and exposure.
aware). Do you consider impacts to urchin and	OSU studies, website creation and stats.	Permanent exhibit in planned center at dock.
crab etc. fisher folk, but bring otters back home!		Campaign with stuffed otter, other related prizes
		like kayak trip, "adopt" an otter if reintroduction
		successful. Streaming video available online and
		in visitor center, new marine center (future),
		OHSU field station, etc. Information on health and
		activities of otters as colony establishes and
		growth. (newsletter electronic and some on
		paper), ask PO City Council to authorize Otter as
		town mascot, organization Sea Other Friends with
		both free and sponsored memberships. What
		about New River, Bandon Marsh NWR etc? Are
		any of the local estuaries suitable for re-
		introduction like Elkhorn Slough? Seems like
		South Slough might be a possibility. Local author
		Ann Vileisis wrote a book on abalones.
1) Fisheries 2) Harsh conditions not conducive to	Make sure you're not spinning your wheels and	Don't introduce them here. Keep the wellbeing of
habitation 3) Vilifying shellfish fisheries 4) We've	damaging valuable, sustainable fisheries vital to	the existing flora and fauna. Sustain the human
been getting along fine without them 5) Strays	the economy and culture of the community; it is	interests balance fisheries based on all the
[] have not settled here	so fabulous here without them. why risk it? I	existing data which has no sea otter in the
	question if there was ever great abundance here	equation
	locally? No relief here	
otters eat sea urchins and I harvest them	impacting divers, processors, restaurants	[]

Table 7 Next steps comments received from Gold Beach, OR on June 23, 2023.

What specific criteria do you want to be sure we	What are the best measures for the criteria you	How might we manage socioeconomic impacts
consider in this area?	identified?	in a fair and equitable way?
If after rigorous study, the reintroduction of	The benefits of ecosystem restoration to me, and	
otters is deemed likely to be successful;	my family, are largely not measurable in	
reintroduction should be attempted. The	monetary units. Rather a more intact near-shore	
ecosystem services provided by re-establishment	ecosystem enhances a sense of balance and well-	
of viable localized populations will justify the	being. That's enough for me.	
effort. Economic benefits to inshore fisheries and		
tourism will result from restoration of the		
Positive impact to salmonids. Does a more robust		Work with ODFW fishery managers to address
kelp forest help with warming ocean conditions.		concerns
Would Crook Point/ Pistol River/ Meyers Creek be		
a possible release site. Pistol River may have a		
large sanddollar population. Meyers Cr. ss a local		
razor clam spot.		
the ecological benefits that could result from sea	It's important to me the river estuaries and near	I wouldn't ask an beneficiaries to pay those
otter populations. our near shore kelp	shore be returned to healthy habitats for fish and	industries that will be neg. affected. However, a
environment is almost gone. Need to stop the	wildlife. This will be measured by increases in	wealthy advocate of sea otter reintroduction
decline!	harvestable and watchable fish and wildlife.	could help refit some vessels (oyster fisheries)
		and businesses with equipment that enables
		operations. Or specific grants to help retrain
		urchin divers in other ocean businesses such as
		tourism that will grow as result of sea ottersor
		buy back urchin permits.

What specific criteria do you want to be sure we consider in this area?	What are the best measures for the criteria you identified?	How might we manage socioeconomic impacts
pre and post release crab densities and landings; urchin numbers and commercial landings; oyster population (esp. Coos Bay) - support the industry by helping (\$) them transition to rearing systems that otters can't get into; monitor return of kelp and eelgrass populations (and their associated ecosystems) as otter pops grow	Identify crabbers that specialize in shallow water crabbing (< 100 feet) and compare their catches pre release to catches post release standardized for the total catch; buy out urchin divers [.]	For years, groups that support wildlife management have suggested an exercise tax on outdoor gear (binos, tents, etc) that non-hunters purchase that could go into the Pittman-Robertson Fund for wildlife management. They have been unsuccessful in accomplishing this after 30-40 yrs of trying. Lessons: something needs to be set up way ahead of release of sea otters — if you are not working on this already, you are way (!) behind; its going to take both a huge grass roots movement combined w/ unswerving gov't support and bipartisan legislation to make this happen; we need someone who's job this is in the USF&WS (their only job) for it to succeed; persistence is king! Good luck — I support the reintroduction of sea otters without any hesitation!
The most important concern to me is the benefit of sea otters to the marine environment, local oyster farms could have a compensation plan similar to those in place where wolves are introduced and ranchers are compensated when wolves kill livestock.	There already exist environmental measures that would easily determine the benefits of otter reintroduction.	
Presence of formerly extirpated species must take priority over any socio-economic considerations. Depressed local economy – Gold Beach! (written on top of card)		

Table 8 Next steps comments received from Brookings, OR on June 24, 2023.

What specific criteria do you want to be sure we	What are the best measures for the criteria you	How might we manage socioeconomic impacts
consider in this area?	identified?	in a fair and equitable way?
Impacts (direct and indirect) to commercial and		
recreational fisheries, specifically D. crab, but also		
other fisheries. Impacts to support businesses		
(fishing), processing sector. Impacts to seafood		
consumers.		
The above plus, concerns for the viability of our	How do you measure socio/ cultural importance	Keep some areas separate? Our traditional model
clam populations. There needs to be a	of traditional harvest, regulated harvest, of	of conservation in America has been a huge
management plan with minimum and maximum	shellfish and furbearers; there will be economic	success in ensuring a future for fish and wildlife.
population goals. Spatial distribution should also	losses to the clam fishery	The term "compensatory harvestable number"
be considered		apply's to sea otters as well. Hunters, fishers, and
		trappers pay for wildlifes well-being. We help to
		keep the ecosystem balanced, instead of extreme
		shifts in populations and conditions, Man IS an
		integral part of the ecosystem.

Table 9 Next steps comments received from Arcata, CA on June 25, 2023.

What specific criteria do you want to be sure we consider in this area?	What are the best measures for the criteria you identified?	How might we manage socioeconomic impacts in a fair and equitable way?
Effects on oyster & crab fishing - Possible increase in tourism	Monitoring diversity if kelp beds increase	
		Not exactly on target, butis there any data on Dungeness crab recruitment as function of kelp? Is it possible/likely that otters could boost crab recruitment (via kelp recovery) enough to offset competition for adult crabs with humans?
The bacteria pollution in local rivers & streams. A benefit that is important to me is that sea otter reintroduction could be a potential driver for local ecotourism activities. As a member of [], it	A good measurement would be to coordinate with the rowing crews on keeping a tally or running count of otter [].	
would make our rowing experience far more exciting to witness sea otter pups on the bay.		
Socioeconomic impacts including shellfish - specifically Dungeness crab -fisheries	The culture of our community (Trinida, CA) is firmly rooted in Dungeness crab fishing. If sea otters devastate crabs the future of the community is at stake.	
Consider relocating to an existing SMR or State Marine Reserve-no impacts to economic recreation harvest. If I understand correctly, reintroducing otters part of the ecosystem will bolster even more the rationale for the reserve! And thus [].	Idea of the MPA's, the goal is to have [] from MPA's out with all species- including otters-to help with health & balance of ecosystem outside SMR	

What specific criteria do you want to be sure we consider in this area?	What are the best measures for the criteria you identified?	How might we manage socioeconomic impacts in a fair and equitable way?
More than anything the health of local fisheries	Quality and health of ecosystem for instance, you	To make the anticipated gains of this otter
matter to me.	must find an indicator species such as	release visible and measurable to the public, you
	nudibranchs or sea slugs to prove your	must be open, allow visitation and provide
	environment is more healthy over time.	interpretation for your work. In addition, you
		must communicate clearly with the biggest
		stakeholders (fishermen) who are already
		economically stressed thru salmon regulations
		and whale entanglement laws why you are doing
		this; More education and accessibility to
		education is your answer. Crab and uni prices will
		be driven up substantially more making local
		caught crab unexcessible to the locals who
		already are having a hard time affording it.
		Ecotourism is being gamed in this process, and
		locals do not like that, this further housing crisis
		in the area. Perhaps AirB and B should be held
		accountable for further financial loss.

What specific criteria do you want to be sure we consider in this area?	What are the best measures for the criteria you identified?	How might we manage socioeconomic impacts in a fair and equitable way?
Work with the tribes, ask them what they want! Interpretation - spread the word & increase awareness, let's build partnership among agencies, communities, & tribes.	Keep track of demographics you hear back from, not reach out too. Advertise more for events like this so more people can come, find ways to get people involved. Meet them where they are.	Improve your communications to make them accessible, your project will never be equitable if only some people understand it enough to share their voice. *Consider who will benefit from the anticipated gains and who could suffer direct loses, fishermen will be your biggest stakeholder and have the highest potential to be negatively impacted by sea otter reintroduction. Ask them how you can better serve them, create partnerships, provide supplies. *If fishermen are catching less crabs, they should be compensated for losses. Then, crabs will become more expensive for community members, we need a solution so that not only rich people can access those marine resources for this to work. *Lots of our local community does not like tourists or ecotourism, unfortunately. Those that do seem to create more AirBnBs that furthers our housing crisis. How do we encourage economically sustainable ecotourism in this area to offset losses in crabbing?
Tribal subsistence on mussels & salmonids. At what population level would cultural harvest of otters be considered for regalia use.	Potential limits on mussel harvest.	Be sure to involve fisheries folks in planning for ecotourism.

What specific criteria do you want to be sure we consider in this area?	What are the best measures for the criteria you identified?	How might we manage socioeconomic impacts in a fair and equitable way?
Tribal shellfish harvesting (particularly clams), in		Reintroducing otters in areas with the least
Humboldt Bay commercial oyster industry in		socioeconomic impacts is important because I
North Humboldt Bay. Also large Hmong		want this to succeed! Someone mentioned
population in Eureka/Fortuna that harvest clams.		introducing them to the type of marine protected
Recreational crabbers as well as commercial.		area that excludes all fishing (I think its a marine
		reserve?) because that could limit conflicts with
		people - and hopefully they could then expand
		from there. I have no idea what sea otters need in
		terms of habitat or the size of the area they need,
		so just brainstorming.
A properly functioning ecosystem is the	only measuring literal costs & benefits misses the	
foundation for a place to thrive in all aspects -	point. Restoring an ecosystem restores a soul.	
ecologically, culturally, socially, economically.	The inherent magnificent of a properly	
Although some adjustments will need to be made	functioning ecosystem where evolution has	
by the human community, the benefits of	shaped complex relationships and organisms are	
restoring sea otters will be significantly positive	in balance with one another cannot be given a	
for the ecosystem humans included.	price. Measures of success should include the []	
	of ecosystem functioning	

Table 10 Next steps comments received at Fort Bragg, CA on June 26, 2023.

What specific criteria do you want to be sure we	What are the best measures for the criteria you	How might we manage socioeconomic impacts
consider in this area?	identified?	in a fair and equitable way?
Being a com. sea urchin diver, my livelihood has		please do not re-intro sea otters here
been bad due to no kelp. The last thing we need is		
having otters re-intro to our coastline. If you need		
more []		
Belonging to a comm. fishing family, we are		Always seems like when people start managing
extremely concerned regarding to bringing the		our sea life things get out of balance. Where they
sea otter to our coast. It would be a disaster to		have introduced sea otters in other areas it have
our crab, abalone and sea urchin industries. Also		devasted the local [] fish completely. We do not
many tourists come to our area to spear fish and		need that on the Mendocino Coast. The economic
they want to be successful. Abalone have started		impact on the comm. fishing industry would be
to come back after years of closure. give them a		drastic.
chance.		
All criteria needs to be considered before	Its more important than dollars lost its livelihoods	We can manage all impacts by not reintroducing.
reintroduction. This isn't about success of a single	and years of tradition that will be changed from	
species (sea otter) it needs to be about diversity.	reintroduction.	
Our shellfish population is of utmost importance.		
Commercial and recreational fisheries are what		
needs to survive on our coast along with the		
remaining red abalone population.		
What matters to my family is what would happen	The abalone are just coming back. What will this	Don't introduce sea otters. Between whales, sea
if sea otters are re-introduced. A sea otter eats 10-	do to the fisheries? The crab fishermen, the sea	lions, seals, harbor seals, etc. There won't be
15 lbs. a day totaling for 9-12 hours. They eat 3x a	urchin diver. Are you going to subsidize? Against	anything left. Then windmills in the ocean!
person per day. Against sea otters.	sea otters	Ridiculous! This would hurt our fisheries. Let
		nature take its course. I don't believe we should
		try to change our seas, but let nature take its
		course. <u>Against!</u>
Sea otters alone will not help our ocean issues.	All of it! I have a monetary interest because I'm a	
They will not eat empty purple urchins. They will	commercial urchin diver	
target the abalone and Red urchins as well as		
other shellfish without helping the problem.		

consider in this area?	identified?	How might we manage socioeconomic impacts in a fair and equitable way?
The warm water blob had a domino effect on the ecosystem. I think letting nature recover without introducing otters that haven't been here in years would mess stuff up.	important on the North coast. I know abalone and	Let the ocean recover without a voracious predator re-introduced (sorry about my spelling)
Hola, mi nombre es []. Y no deseo que las marmotas (sea otters) lleguen a la Costa de Mendocino porque tendremos un efecto negativo con las especies que ahora mismo estan en peligro de extincion como los avulones, el erizo Rojo y otras especies.	Me afectara economicamente porque ahora mismo hay escasesde frizo Rojo y soy la esposa de un Buso commercial y nuestra economia esta siendo afectada ahora mismo y si las marmotas llegan no tendremos el sustento ecomonico. Tenemos hijos en el Colegio y necesitamos que neustra voz sea escuchada.	La llegada de los sea otter afectora qun mas mi economia proque mi familia depende de los beneficios del mar es decir mi esposo es Buso Comercial y si el erizo es eliminado por estas animales nosotoros perderiamos totalmente nuestro sustento economicio. hao un llamado a las personas indicadas de tomar esta decision tan importante que tomen en consideracion a todas las familias que dependemos directamente del producto del oceano.
[], I am a Dive tender for [.]. The introduction of sea otters will affect us negatively because of our fishery. We would appreciate the otters more if they stayed where they are at. Just because we would like to conserve what precious Abalone and urchin we have left!	The money is a big issue. Cost to introduce is also considered, but I'd suggest letting God take care of nature and mankind should step back this time.	I would say maintain things as they are. I understand they want to try to eliminate the purple sea urchins, but let's let God take care of things. When we put our trust in men, we tend to lose.
Having crab, clams, and muscles mean everything. Otter will take all of that away The Mendocino Coast has <u>already</u> seen so much devastation from our ocean temperature to the sea life. The last thing we need is otters!	If the otters show up on their own, than fine, but do not reintroduce them. Our little town has become a tourist trap with no more industry logging gone. Fishing going-this will cripple it.	Look at the lively hood of the Alaska fishing towns- "Proof that the otters" - will further their demise. CDF&W are closing down many fisheries as we sit here.

What specific criteria do you want to be sure we consider in this area?	What are the best measures for the criteria you identified?	How might we manage socioeconomic impacts in a fair and equitable way?
[] I'm especially interested in opportunities for youth outdoor education materials-I'm thinking about visible multi-lingual signage for the casual visitor (similar to park displays and signs) so many younger people generate excitement for conservation by becoming passionate about creatures when they have a first-hand experience.	This reminds me of the binoculars set up at the Monterey Bay Aquarium-public-facing interactive displays like the Exploratorium (in San Francisco). Maybe there are possible QR-code displays that would allow people to interact and upload to social media; similar to citizen science/collaborative data collection or interaction! Recording numbers of interactions with educational displays could generate excitement for ecotourism benefits to local businesses.	"taco tally": local fisheries/fish taco joints- could charge an extra \$1 for an otter: "dollar for an otter"- donate an extra dollar to support fishery efforts to integrate otter transition. Could be a local initiative at lots of local stores, donation boxes at Little Free Libraries, coffee shops. Contests to name an otter; feature a display of the people who donate. Check out Marine Mammal Center, "adoption cards". Showcase cards with photos of the animals that people are financially supporting through their donations. Local businesses could have occasional events to fundraise and feature a "mascot". A photo and a
		specific otter that they are associated with. Similar to "adopt a highway". Could have trivia nights about otters generally, and rosters of the specific otters.
I am old enough to remember otters in Elk. This is	I think there is nothing but good on all grounds.	Otters benefit us all.
the single most thrilling, exciting news, possibly		
since bringing back brown pelicans from DDT. I		
really hope this moves forward. Makes me cry		
just to think that otters might return.		
We don't want any sea otter in Fort Bragg Area - North of California.		
There are so many significant changes occurring	Keep otters where they are and if the otters want	Don't spend money on trying to reintroduce
in the oceans right now I do not think sea otters	to come here then that is what nature intended.	otters.
will help us identify the causes and effects. I		
would like to see return of abalone harvesting.		
Healthy environment for all sea creatures and	Eliminate plastic to best of our ability! Enforce	
clean water and beaches. No more pollution.	recycling- not into the ocean.	

What specific criteria do you want to be sure we consider in this area?	What are the best measures for the criteria you identified?	How might we manage socioeconomic impacts in a fair and equitable way?
This area is in destress from a warm water event	Please leave nature to recover "Not" put human	Please leave "Nature" to heal. Don't let man
that has left the abalone and all other shellfish in	intervention in play. The resource is very fragile	screw it up again.
distress. If otters are introduced it would be a	now leave it to heal.	
death blow that we would never recover from in		
our lifetime.		
Economic benefits to small coastal communities		
that benefit from abalone hunting (campgrounds,		
local stores and restaurants) that would benefit		
from reintroduction. Educational opportunities		
for public to learn about environmental websI'd		
like to see getting community involvement by		
having support from local community/citizen		
scientist. (circled Tribal subsistence and sea- otter-		
proof gear on the card)		
Responsible leadership and management of ALL	Divers removing purple sea urchins using	
our shellfish resources. F&W has failed to honor	EFEICIENT tools can and will, w/funding at	
"zonal management" of otters in S. Cal. I was	traditional dive fishery sites, restore both kelp	
there- broken promises and lost fisheries are the	and shellfish.	
trademark of U.S. F&WLS. Fisheries are food-		
Natural to healthy -otters restore Nothing.		
No Otter's	No Otter's	First we have to fix the kelp that has not returned.
Care and concern for the otters 1st.	No taxes whatsoever. Fines for violations.	The otters should have 100% protection. The amount of food they eat should not be considered as a loss to anybody. There are NO negative economic effects. They were here 1st: Bring them back
I am a Native American that live here in Fort	It's going to take our gathering away!	
Bragg all my life. If this ever happen it's going to		
take our food sources away like the abalone, and		
mussels. It not right.		

Table 11 Next steps comments received from Bodega Bay, CA on June 27, 2023.

What specific criteria do you want to be sure we consider in this area?	What are the best measures for the criteria you identified?	How might we manage socioeconomic impacts in a fair and equitable way?
		My main concern is whether you plan to wait till the abalone population has stabilized prior to reintroduction
Ocean health, kelp health, species diversity, good diving	As a dive instructor and recreational scuba and free diver, having a healthy ocean is a huge priority for me and my family, and my fellow divers. If otters help, I am all for a measured, careful reintroduction.	People love to see wildlife in their natural environment. When I dive overseas, we always pay a fee to dive any marine area (sanctuary). Couldn't we do that to help support the commercial industry?
We the people want to share in the harvest of shellfish. Balance, don't let cute sea otter strip mine the coast line. Rehabilitate their existing zones. No otters in [] Sonoma Mendocino and up	What about the 40,000 + divers plus families and friend lost to urchins killing the abalone? We can see otters in the Monterey	Billionaires want sea otters the little people who visit the sea shore and bond with nature do not; millions of people who experience harvesting from the sea, do not want to see strip mining by otters. Share! Please fix their zone by removing urchins. Thank you
You can not provide socioeconomic benefits to much of the coast as it is sparsely populated. Abalone fishing was the main benefit for many and some have gone out of business due to lack of abalone diving	Not easy to measure as the multiple factors involved are not easy to fix/resolve. Abalone diving will not be legal again in my lifetime.	I don't think sea otter's would bring a great deal of economic gain. Monterey has gain because of the city location and easy viewing of otters. That would be hard to replicate on a sparsely populated coast. We have a very richly populated coast for 150+ years with otters and lack of otters is not the proximate cause of the loss of kelp.
I feel that the positive effects (economic cultural etc.) of reintroduction of an otter population far out way the negative effects. I feel confident that you are doing you FULL do diligence. Count me in the FOR Reintroduction camp.	see above	

Table 12 Next step comments received in Point Reyes, CA on June 27, 2023.

What specific criteria do you want to be sure we consider in this area?	What are the best measures for the criteria you identified?	How might we manage socioeconomic impacts in a fair and equitable way?
1) Economic benefits of long term effects on biodiversity 2) Economic benefits to local communities from sea otter driven ecotourism 3) Effects on coastal erosion/coastal infrastructure from recovery of kelp 4) Carbon sequestration by kelp Working w/the oyster farmers to show them "safe gear" (otter-proof) is very important even if it turns out the that the sea otters don't choose oysters. The same goes for crab fishermen who are finding making a living even more difficult. Year by year. I'm sure that the Native tribes would be very happy to see the otters return, but whether they should be allowed to harvest them might cause a culture clash, especially because they are no longer really dependent of them for \$ "survival".	1) Dollars 2)Dollars 3)Changes in shoreline, dollars spent on repair after coastal erosion/mass wasting 4) Carbon sequestered (see the comments above). More tourism would be difficult for the local communities.	Reasonable local taxes might help spread the gains by certain industries. Applying these to large businesses that might benefit more easily (or be less impacted by short term changes, like commercial crab fisheries that can fish for crabs deeper than sea otters) is particularly important. The county should contribute extra sales tax revenues to help our small communities deal with extra trash a need for more restrooms, parking (a real special problem). Probably eco-friendly buses to carry large groups of tourists would help w/traffic and parking.
It's important to me that we do everything possible to help the sea otters get reestablished throughout their historical range.	the sea otter population growing steadily.	Help aquaculture relocate to deeper waters.
I feel that the environmental and ecological impacts are some of the most important as they lead into the others. The spiritual aspects, economy, and cultural all depend on the otters establishing themselves and changing the environment.	I will trust in your expertise to tell how well the otters are being established and what impacts they are having on the environment.	Perhaps you could help subsidize the negatively impacted industries to help make the necessary changes that will be needed to avoid impacting the sea otter population. Overall, I think the economic gains will be more and more impactful than the losses. Not just in terms of fisheries industries, but also other benefits such as reduced erosion and re-establishment of kelp and seagrass which will help in carbon extraction.

What specific criteria do you want to be sure we	What are the best measures for the criteria you	How might we manage socioeconomic impacts
consider in this area?	identified?	in a fair and equitable way?
As someone who fishes in to Tomales bay, I see a	measures of "blue carbon", number of urchins,	One concern I see could be conflicts w/ local
potential benefit from reduction in urchins and	and a variety of ecological monitoring efforts	shellfish fisheries. One way to mitigate these
an increase in kelp stands at the mouth of the	(plankton, seabirds, other carnivores) may help	conflicts could be funds for farmers to switch to
bay. Otters would help build resilience in the	measure the above criteria.	fishing gear that would deter/ prevent otters
ecological communities to global change.		form stealing farmed shellfish.
The most important consideration is climate	I am a native of Marin 39-year resident of West	I realize the Elkhorn Slough has significant
change and the need to protect and expand	Marin. I am an avid ocean [] having sailed solo	pressure from visitors. But it is one of the few
biodiversity for the health of the planet and all	1/2 way around the world, an abalone diver, and	places accessible to the public for viewing sea
human live living on it.	a salmon fisherman. While I am aware that some	otters in the wild. Reintroducing populations will
	in my trade are not in favor, or have concerns	provide more opportunities for the public as well
	about reintroduction, I do not think that should	as promote a healthier environment. Oyster
	be a consideration. There is an excellent study	growers on Tomales Bay are leasing public lands,
	· ·	their economic concerns should not trump the
	benefits of national parks, related to improved	public interest in promoting biodiversity. The
	mental health. It dwarfs the economies that feel	focus should be on co-existence-not exclusive use
	threatened by sea otters. Moreover, promoting	by an industry.
	healthier more biodiverse ecosystems, is ,	,
	according to the health experts I work with,	
	fundamental to mitigating/adapting to climate	
	change.	
>The impact of a species being reintroduced with	Understand our small coastal villages : how	
[] consequence. Take a look at what happened	people use this local waters for business and	
here with the intro of Tule elk with no natural	pleasure. Also consider impact of increased	
predators. Not a good story, > impact on local	visitors drawn to see otters. Our parks are	
oyster farms in Tomales Bay.	overloved and reaching capacity. Thanks for an	
,	informative evening!	
Local oyster farms switch to sea-otter-proof gear.	We should not always prioritize corporate or	
	human profits. Sea otters were here before	
	humans. We must learn to adapt and co-exist	
	with them. My family is a family of recreational	
	fishermen. We would be happy to see sea otters	
	return.	

What specific criteria do you want to be sure we consider in this area?	What are the best measures for the criteria you identified?	How might we manage socioeconomic impacts in a fair and equitable way?
Too soon to relocate-firmly establish the kelp	The reintroduction population needs to be	
·	controlled. The original 50 in Southern Cal. Now is	
0	3,000! Red flag!	
Socioeconomic considerations do not matter to	-	
me.		
Restoring sea otters to the Bay Area-for climate	Bring back a healthy water system and restore	Maybe we need to reprioritize - have a better
control-kelp and eelgrass for carbon	balance.	environment.
sequestration.		
enhance eelgrass and kelp	do they improve	subsidize oyster farm production
Abalone fishing and spear fishing are my main	Economically, that is really hard to place value on.	How can an Abalone fishery co exist with sea
areas of interest, and things that will support		otters? To my knowledge, as it currently exists,
those or harm it are important to me		the rules on the abalone fishery state that the
		presence of sea otters will automatically close the
		fishery. This needs to be addressed and clarified.

Table 13 Next steps comments received at Sausalito, CA on June 28, 2023.

What specific criteria do you want to be sure we consider in this area?	What are the best measures for the criteria you identified?	How might we manage socioeconomic impacts in a fair and equitable way?
Step back, look at the data and present	Biodiversity, health of great eco-system	Present data on effects on environment. Give
opportunities (tourism, cod fish increase, etc.) to		people the opportunity to siege the new paths to
the community. Things change and we must		a livelihood. Perhaps funding for new equip or the
adapt. In other words, show how those impacted		purchase of obsolete equip. Show data on other
can adjust their livelihood in response to otters.		regions and the impact, economically, on otters.
		Things change. we cannot support a depleted
		eco-system for the financial benefit of a few.
Sorry, socioeconomic issues are not that	A fairly stable population of sea otters. The return	The return of the kelp forests= nature's nursery
important to me. Sea otters used to be here and	of kelp forests. (absence of urchin barrens) I	for young would increase fish numbers (not
they were nearly wiped out by humans. They	understand that the hope is to get tour boats out	salmon) many of the oysters aren't even natives,
should be restored and the environment should	in the bays to "otter watch" but I'm hoping more	they're Asian imports. Sure they can farm them
be brought back into balance as much as possible.	people will kayak and paddle to see otters.	here, artificial methods. Abalone are gone in this
I get politics, but socioeconomic issues just aren't	(necessary to reduce human presence during	area but not due to otters. If the environment is
important to me.	baby season)	healthier maybe better survival of abalone and
		other fish. (Look at the pollution level of beaches
		in the area). Don't get me wrong about oysters-
		quite tasty! But maybe the oyster farms shouldn't
		exist in wilderness areas.
Reintroduction in areas that have less	Education about human effects on all wildlife,	Environmental Groups, Donors, should be part of
disturbances (visitation, fishing, boating) but have	especially things like rubber bands for hair, masks,	funding for safer methods of all fishing, shellfish
best chance kelp and sea otters to flourish. We	plastics, disturbing wildlife, trampling through	harvesting. Funds to be used as a means to get
need honor tribal subsistence and trust that their	food sources and restoring habitat regardless of	folks to comply. Also, increase enforcement in
values will aid survival. No culling instead use as	species- Develop information for schools to share	newly introduced areas- on shore signs but also
food source or replacement or relocation of new	with K-12 and up. Teachers can become part of	off shore. Fines should ramp up if boats enter
colonies or existing. If needed, find funding from	the solution and most love good lesson plans	areas repeatedly. No Tourist Boats in
NGO's for sea otter [] gear. Educate the public at	about different habitats and need to preserve	reintroduced sea otter areas and reduced
all beaches whether or not sea otters are there or	them. Measure of effects-less trash, disturbance,	fishing/shell fishing at least until the new colony
not. Education should include trash management.	see kids and adults teaching them survival of	establishes its self. Perhaps Indigenous Tribes can
	reintroduced. Sea otters, stable environment of	help with education of enforcement.
	all species	

What specific criteria do you want to be sure we	What are the best measures for the criteria you	How might we manage socioeconomic impacts
consider in this area?	identified?	in a fair and equitable way?
Preserve and restore Biodiversity; otter		
populations currently are way below historic		
levels suggest introduction in open shores not		
only in protected area, plus love taking pictures of		
otters.		
Effect on increase of ecotourism due to	Dollars gained/lost for ecotourism, fishing and	We should make sure the possible negative
reintroduction. Effect on recreational/	diving. Significance to coastal tribal culture	economic impacts to crab and oyster fisheries are
commercial abalone and fishing due to	measured by direct surveys, consultation with	balanced by and offset with economic gains to fin
reintroduction of a top predator on purple	tribal leaders, and actual costal visitation	fisheries, diving and ecotourism. We should
urchins. Effect on cultural value to California	increases by tribal members. Total tonnage of	determine localized gains in small community
coastal tribes such as Pomo. Effect on	purple urchins predated by otters in urchin	areas; for instance gains by local abalone divers,
recreational/commercial divers who value bull	barrens.	boat and kayak operators, tour groups and hotel
kelp over urchin barrens		operators.
What mattes to me is that sea otters are	Carbon rayes or offsets that correlate to amount	If coastal communities are down to have sea
reintroduced back to native range to improve	of new biomass regrown in new areas	otters introduced in their region, compensation
generic biodiversity/resilience to climate change		for potential crab/shellfish losses could be paying
b/c of how they improve CO2 sequestration of		either all citizens of that town or owners of
ecosystems they are in.		crabbing operations money from increased
		carbon sequestration (don't know through what
		market or funds this would come from).
Greater focus on biodiversity benefits to local		
economic considerations.		
Increased health of eelgrass beds in SF Bay	Measuring extent and density of eelgrass and	
resulting in increased fish reproduction. Few	genetic diversity, catch of herring and roe.	
target crab species (Dungeness) for crab fishers in	Development of Bay access business (e.g., kayak	
SF Bay estuary. Potential tourist benefit in	rental, guides).	
regional parks in East Bay near San Pablo Bay		
Helpful to kelp which I hope would benefit	Re-introducing wildlife makes one proud.	
fisheries. Also should benefit local businesses		
dependent on tourism.		

What specific criteria do you want to be sure we consider in this area?	identified?	How might we manage socioeconomic impacts in a fair and equitable way?
I care most about the overall health of the ocean		Get the fishers who might be impacted by a
ecosystem (and the ecosystem of the SF Bay) and		decrease in urchin and shellfish they harvest to
believe that the sea otter are a critical part of that	l	take people on tours to see the sea otter and
ecosystem and should be reintroduced.	ecosystems over the long term.	share their knowledge of the oceans and
		observations of how sea otters that have been
		reintroduced have had. They can be on the front
		lines of this issue to help lead it forward rather than fighting it.
The balancing of all these factors is important to	I think <u>pre</u> evaluation is important. How was the	I'm not sure their concerns are real. Numerous
me. What will the climate be like in 10-20 years?	yield for fisherman/women in the 5 years before	places in the world were once fishing, locals
	the introduction? I am trying to address the	(Bristow, UK, coast of Maine). Without some
	concerns of those who would <u>object</u> to the	controls humans will over fish to their own
	reintroduction.	detriment, and they are likely to blame anything
		except their own actions. As in the efforts to
		distribute the water from the Sacramento Delta;
		the "solution" was to bring together <u>all</u> the
		stakeholders and eventually there was buy in
		from all.
Overall ecosystem impact- likely positive. Impact	hard \$ impact on commercial fishing-if any	Direct reimbursement from winners to losers
on commercial fishing. Balance = undo human		would be very difficult. Positive eco-tourist
impact/ hunting		impact=more tax revenue. A government funded
		"insurance fund" for potentially impacted
		industries for a fixed period (? 10 years) might
		make sense.
Sea otter reintroduction is critical for tribal	Include indigenous communities in all aspects and	
benefits, and the animals would draw visitors and	stages of the reintroduction process- as integral	
enhance tourism on the California coast. Thank	partners from beginning not just as a group to	
you for providing opportunities for feedback for	comment on plans that have already been	
this important project.	created.	
effects to kelp health and Eco sustainability	re-populate kelp beds	

What specific criteria do you want to be sure we consider in this area?	•	How might we manage socioeconomic impacts in a fair and equitable way?
Climate effects on society as a whole. Besides the	Return sea otters to the coast to help foster the growth of kelp. Combine this with kelp planting as a climate engineering mechanism. Plant	Restore the ecosystem and everyone will benefit
areas coon	the coast. Otters are critical to this.	
Benefits from tourism increases due to otter restoration, Benefits to tribal culture and subsistence, ecosystem restoration and improvements with concomitant effects on climate change and therefore on social/economic regimes	Dollars are OK as a measure, but there should be measures of non-monetary benefits such as cultural values, increased support for wildlife/ecosystem survival-and therefore our survival.	

What are the best measures for the criteria you	How might we manage socioeconomic impacts
•	in a fair and equitable way?
	Involve all stakeholder groups early in the process
_	of <u>research</u> and development of the draft plan.
fishing community at the <u>outset</u> of the	Do not dismiss anecdotal data; but actively seek
proposal/planning process. [] great source of	out respected sources in each community.
info.	
	proposal/planning process. [] great source of info.

Table 14 Next step comments received from San Francisco, CA on June 28, 2023.

What specific criteria do you want to be sure we consider in this area?	What are the best measures for the criteria you identified?	How might we manage socioeconomic impacts in a fair and equitable way?
Decreased accessibility to coast b/c of (up arrow)	Slowing of erosion and increased storm	Is there a way to set up local cooperatives that
costs. Cultural values of wildlife, healthy	protection. Joy and happiness of local folks and	can pool new funds from things like tourism to
ecosystems, and joy from seeing otters. Potential	visitors. New businesses/new opportunities for	help support folks losing money and to support
short term negative impacts of crab and urchin	local communities. Increasing/ decreasing	needed improvements to local infrastructure. It
fishers. Economic benefit to recreation providers	biodiversity. H2O clarity other measures of health	seems like there could be a way for folks to be
and coastal restaurants and hotels. Crowding and	of esp. the SF Bay.	given or to earn or buy shares in a cooperative
infrastructure pressure on small coastal		and then they can share in the benefit. I'm sure
communities with lots of visitors already. Positive		there a models for something like this maybe in
impacts of climate and ecosystem health. Cultural		other types of systems. The heritage of fishing is
importance benefit for tribes.		important to preserve but maybe there is a way
		to balance things through more sharing of risks
		and benefits.
I'm a diver. I love to shoot fish, take abs, find	More kelp is the measure of improvement	Since otters eat anything that swims slower than
scallops. The effort most recently in this area-		them, shellfish are at the greatest risk of being
North coast- has been to remove the purple		taken. To regain a population of shellfish that is
urchin in an attempt to allow the kelp beds to		sustainable enough for people to enjoy may be a
reestablish. With the kelp comes fish, abs, more		dream with otters in the area
diversity.		
recreational crab fishing	Dungeness crab caught in bay	Can you buy-back permits from the fishermen
		affected?
Consider whether limited subsistence harvest by		Limit new entries to fisheries that will be
Tribes (no resale use the model with eagle		impacted by otters. Grandfather existing users of
feathers) can increase acceptance by Tribes.		the fishery. For potential new fisheries of finfish,
Evaluate by local area. Ask SF Bay Tribes if this is		impose a fee to transfer to impacted fishers.
an issue for them.		
That local governments are prepared to protect	Local education on why and how to support. We	San Francisco tourism benefits all. People love
otters from humans and local environmental	love our oysters but love animals just as much.	visiting the sea lions at Pier 39. Sea otters could
issues.		bring a similar socioeconomic value.

What specific criteria do you want to be sure we consider in this area?	What are the best measures for the criteria you identified?	How might we manage socioeconomic impacts in a fair and equitable way?
Yes come up with solutions to the groups that perceive that this will harm their business. A healthy ocean life benefits everyone eventually. Make the oceans healthy again and it will help all	Example Pier 39-many people did not like the seals taking over, but they became great for business. Push the benefits of a healthy earth/ocean.	Listen to their concerns and work with these groups to overcome the possible bad side effects. Anticipate the possible loses and try to avoid or reduce the problems
I want the reintroduction of sea otters to their historical ranges, without considering ANY human economic impact. They must be reintroduced purely for the preservation of the species, which will rebuild the kelp forests, fin fish populations and other species, for which we are directly responsible for decimating in the first place!	Forget economic advantages/ disadvantages! Our wildlife should just be here because it's best for humans if it is. No ifs, and or buts! I mean come on! Really? Find another source of income that doesn't fuck up the world anymore than it already is!	
My primary interest is in SF Bay- Richardson Bay in particular. There is very limited fishing or boat traffic and yet lots of eelgrass and a nearby kayaking rental (Sausalito). Ecotourism- otter viewing- would grow and I would like to see that.	Count the kayakers that visit Richardson Bay (northern section off of the Audubon site). Team with the kayak rental firms to get their data as well as the local chamber of commerce. Much of Richardson Bay can also be viewed easily from land near Blackies Pasture and the hiking trails.	I would not try to have the "winners" pay the "losers", but rather work with those who are truly affected cover their loss. Repurchase permits and a higher price than paid for example, using funds raised via a Reintroduction Foundation.
USFWS Survey of Wildlife Watching in 2011, published in 2012, revealed several billion and in income to the State, 10X more than hunting.	Repeat the above report but model in the Elkhorn Slough economics pub just out. []	

Table 15 Next step comments received in Emeryville, CA on June 29, 2023.

What specific criteria do you want to be sure we consider in this area?	What are the best measures for the criteria you identified?	How might we manage socioeconomic impacts in a fair and equitable way?
A healthy ecosystem regardless of economical	Ocean health is the most economic effect. I	What price does a dead zone have? A healthy
profits or losses. On land we have parks to	believe a healthy kelp forest benefits all in the	ocean can produce a viable fishery. There is no
protect species in the ocean less so. Profit is	long term dollars-smollars are merely short term	long term or short term downside.
transitory-a healthy ocean should not be	values	
Potential for growth in local tourism. I went to	Dollars gained, number of increased visitors,	Don't give the shellfishers an outside importance.
Elkhorn Slough to rent a kayak and see the otters	number of new businesses longevity of that	While their concerns have value, they should not
there. After talking about it, my parents came	ecotourism.	trump the myriad benefits that come from
from Washington to kayak with the otters		reintroducing keystone species to imperiled
		ecosystems.
Benefits to small local businesses, continue to	EMOTIONAL CONNECTION, SENSE OF	
prove to shellfisheries that long term kelp	WILDERNESS, ECOSYSTEM HARMONY, MYRIAD	
ecosystem health will resume in the sustainability	ECOLOGICAL BENEFITS, CARBON SEQUESTRATION	
of their industry. Consider genetic	·	
mixing/population connectivity- cute pics will win		
em over!		
1) [] socioeconomic benefits of improved	1)dollars of property values in areas vulnerable to	I know that shellfish fisheries would be most
climate resilience of area, i.e., supporting coasts	climate shocks and erosion 2)amount of	impacted. Consulting them for ideas might be
against erosion 2)funding for clean up of polluted	pollutants in area and estimated cost of clean up-	useful, but I am curious about if there are small
area-using otters as a charismatic lever to clean	find the optimized place for more pollutants/less	family fisheries or larger corporate entities. We
up oil and toxin pollution-good for us an otters	cost 3)local schools in area, sort of counting	shouldn't do anything substantial for the
3)opportunity for wildlife education for children	against high population in an area as a negative	corporations, and should focus on those with a
		real connection to the shellfish as a livelihood. In
		another context, large corporate farms have had
		an outside influence blocking logical climate
		adaptation in California. Large corporate almond,
		pistachio, and avocado farms in the Central
		Valley. They receive large backing from federal
		government on crop insurance, and it creates a
		perverse incentive to stay in business despite the
		large water use that makes no sense during a
		drought-filled future. Fish & Wildlife should avoid
		creating such a system with shellfish farms.

What specific criteria do you want to be sure we consider in this area?	What are the best measures for the criteria you identified?	How might we manage socioeconomic impacts in a fair and equitable way?
Intrinsic value of sea otters, plus their importance to local marine ecosystem	Established populations along the coast	Don't just evaluate impacts to fishing communitiesweigh the broader benefits to the local community in terms of tourism, etc. & plus the value of healthy ecosystems (ecosystem services).
No direct economics for me. But an Oakland resident with a small clean running modern engine boat. We enjoy the wonders of sea life-Been to Pt Lobos! Family joy. Would like however this project could help the resilience of the Bay/ Estuary and mammal and grasses to help the environment of the Bay and ocean.	I cannot think of any I am not any type of hunter or fisherperson. Just love what could improve basic ecology of the waters and animals. Fish etc. therein.	No idea
I want to see sea otters re-introduced in places where they will have the best chance of success with the fewest socioeconomic impacts. The physical environment (i.e. water depth, temperature, hiding places) cannot possibly support thousands of sea otters, but it would be great if there were a few hundred and especially enough to bridge the genetic gap between northern and southern sea otters.		Sea otters re-introduction is likely to be an overall net benefit to everyone- I think the fears of losses to fisheries are overblown.
The most important thing is restoring balance to the marine ecosystem. This may involve costs to fisheries but they're going to have problems b/c of climate change. Economic benefits of sea otters are diffuse but real.	Growth in ecotourism, growth in Tribal subsistence and increased cultural pride, growth in kelp forests and decreased abalone loss - all these are more important than dollars.	I am sympathetic to fisheries concerns, can they receive subsidies or grants? OR/California cap and trade funds could go to them. We must restore the kelp to save the marine ecosystem and do carbon capture via the kelp forests. For all this we must bring the sea otters back to their home range to give the ecosystem a fighting chance to stabilize and adapt to climate change.

Table 16 Next step comments received that were not labeled. These comments were received during the June 20 – 29, 2023 timeframe.

What specific criteria do you want to be sure we consider in this area? Focus on how they help maintain robust kelp forests that increase fish populations and sequester carbon. Also focus on how the tourism will economically benefit communities with ecotourism. tribal subsistence fishing and their Traditional Ecological Knowledge (TEK); economic benefits for eco-tourism and tribal tourism; nature and ecological photography; reintroduction and protection of keystone species; toxoplasmosis	What are the best measures for the criteria you identified? measure the growth of kelp forests in the reintroductory areas and the increase in fish populations. Also measure the tourism with economic studies in communities and the reintroduction locations. Decreased overabundance of sea urchin. Increase of endangered Bull Kelp. Increase in Tribal and Eco-tourism. Increase in water quality. Joy and awe in seeing native sea otters once again in their ancestral habitat.	How might we manage socioeconomic impacts in a fair and equitable way? If fish and crab stocks decline due to otters, supplement fishermen's incomes with taxes on vacation rentals throughout the state. Enact a special tax on them for wildlife rehabilitation. Start a Fisherpersons' Fund to compensate and train fish and shellfish industry in other fields. Pay fisherpersons not to fish.
and educating the public re cat feces. I believe the reintroduction of sea otters will increase the economic benefits to the region, but we need to find the proper balance so it will not affect the local fishing industry.	working with those industries (i.e. fisheries, tourism, etc.) to measure if their bottom line is increasing with the introduction of the sea otters. Was any metrics gathered in the other areas where they were introduced to see if socioeconomic gains were made with local business?	1)Have open forums/talks with the local population to hear their concerns for both for and against reintroducing the sea otters. We need to make sure everyone is heard in a safe space. 2) We need to win both their hearts and minds to support the reintroduction of sea otters 3)Can anything that was learned during the reintroduction of sea otters in Alaska (1951-1963), British Columbia (1969-72) and Washington (1969-1970) be applied to successfully reintroduce them back to Oregon and California. THANKS FOR DOING THIS!!
sea otters will wipe out the shellfisheries. End of story. Don't think the kayak rental industry is a good replacement.	Entire industries will die. Example: Columbia River Salmon industry is hardly in existence anymore due to lack of sea lion control. Otters will do the same to shellfish industry. Already did in several areas in Alaska	Go buy all the Dungeness Crab permits on California, Oregon, Washington Coast before you bring in the sea otters. When you're Billion dollars of permits become worthless you will know.
No otters leave them alone	You will need to buy-back shellfish permits like in WA state	You have already took my livelihood

What specific criteria do you want to be sure we consider in this area?	•	How might we manage socioeconomic impacts in a fair and equitable way?
This is a terrible idea it will decimate the shellfish	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	There is no way to offset the loss to the
population. It will destroy the crabs, abalone, and	struggling commercial fishing industry	commercial fishing community. To intentionally
clams		ruin peoples livelihood and way of life is wrong!
Reintroduction could be beneficial to the local		
ecology. But at the first hint of negative effects		
they should be removed.		